

**MINUTES OF THE
STATE OF NEW YORK MORTGAGE AGENCY
AUDIT COMMITTEE
HELD ON THURSDAY, DECEMBER 10, 2015 AT 8:25 A.M.
AT ITS OFFICES AT
641 LEXINGTON AVENUE
NEW YORK, NY 10022**

DIRECTORS AND DESIGNEES

PRESENT:

James S. Rubin	Director
Elaine McCann	New York State Division of the Budget, representing Mary Beth Labate, Director (via videoconference)

ABSENT:

Anthony Bergamo	Committee Chairman
-----------------	--------------------

In the absence of Committee Chairman, Anthony Bergamo, Commissioner James Rubin presided over the meeting.

Mr. Adam H. Schuman, Senior Vice President and Counsel to the Agencies, acted as Secretary. He noted that Ms. Elaine McCann, representing Budget Director, Ms. Mary Beth Labate was participating in the meeting via video conference from the New York State Division of Budget conference center at the Capitol Building Room 131 in Albany. A public notice was given of the time and location of the venues in accordance with the New York State Open Meetings Law.

Mr. Eric Mostert, Chief Fiscal Officer, representing Commissioner Jerry Boone from the New York State Commissioner of Taxation and Finance attended this meeting, as a guest, via video conference from the New York State Division of the Budget conference Center at the Capital building, Room 131 in Albany, NY.

Mr. Schuman asked for motions and seconds to call the Audit Committee meetings to order of the New York State Housing Finance Agency (HFA); the New York State Affordable Housing Corporation (AHC); the State of New York Municipal Bond Bank Agency (MBBA) and the Tobacco Settlement Financing Corporation (TSFC). Ms. Elaine McCann moved to call the HFA and AHC meetings to order; Commissioner James Rubin seconded the motion. Ms. Elaine McCann moved to call the SONYMA meeting to order; Commissioner Rubin second the motion. Ms. Elaine McCann moved to call the MBBA and TSFC meetings to order; Mr. San Filippo seconded the motion.

Mr. Schuman stated that as items are presented to each Committee throughout the meetings, these motions and seconds will be used unless specific items call for a different vote, or unless any Committee member wishes to record his or her vote differently.

Mr. Schuman reported that Commissioner James S. Rubin is the Committee Chairman for the HFA and AHC Audit Committees; that Mr. Kenneth Bialo is the Committee Chairman for MBBA and TSFC Audit Committees and that Mr. Anthony Bergamo is the Committee Chairman for SONYMA Audit Committee. In his absence Commissioner Rubin will chair the SONYMA Audit Committee.

The meetings of the Audit Committees of the affiliated agencies were opened in joint session for the consideration of various matters of shared importance. These minutes reflect only those items being considered by the State of New York Mortgage Agency (SONYMA) Audit Committee. A record of items considered by the Audit Committees of the other affiliated agencies is contained in the minutes of each Committee respectively.

Mr. Schuman stated that for purposes of convenience and to make sure the meetings of the respective agencies go smoothly, items shared by one or more of the Agencies will be presented by MBBA/TSFC Committee Chairman Kenneth Bialo.

The first item on the agenda was the adoption of the minutes of the SONYMA Audit Committee meeting held on September 8, 2015. Absent comments or corrections from the Directors, the minutes were deemed approved.

The next item on the agenda was a resolution regarding the review and approval of Internal Audit Staff Functions. Mr. Stephen B. Chohey, Vice President, Internal Audit, reported that according to the Audit of the Charter of the Audit Committee, each year the Committee must approve the Internal Audit Staff Functions. He stated that the document has been updated, although it is similar to previously submitted documents, noting that the first paragraph highlights the Audit Committee's responsibilities. He explained that the second paragraph highlights the existing internal controls that are in place. He also noted that the document contains the Status Reports sent to the Directors quarterly (March 31, 2016) for approval. He noted that there is a brief background on the entire audit staff and their compensation. He also noted that the hiring process for one additional staff person has commenced.

MBBA/TSFC Committee Chairman Mr. Bialo inquired about the support provided by Internal Audit Staff in connection with the Ernst & Young external audit. Mr. Chohey confirmed that the Agencies supported Ernst & Young as part of its annual reporting process. He said as a result, a sentence will be added to the Internal Audit Staff functions document that outlines the Agencies' cooperation with external auditors.

Mr. Chohey said that management seeks authorization for approval of the Internal Audit Staff Function.

Considering the first and second motions previously entered, the motions were carried, and the following resolution was unanimously adopted:

A RESOLUTION OF THE AUDIT COMMITTEES OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK MORTGAGE AGENCY, THE NEW YORK STATE HOUSING FINANCE AGENCY, THE NEW YORK STATE AFFORDABLE HOUSING CORPORATION, THE STATE OF NEW YORK MUNICIPAL BOND BANK AGENCY AND THE TOBACCO SETTLEMENT FINANCING CORPORATION REVIEWING AND APPROVING AN INTERNAL AUDIT STAFF FUNCTION PLAN.

The next item on the agenda was a resolution approving SONYMA's Servicer Audit of Community Bank together with Management's response. Mr. Chohey reported that the Internal Audit group reviewed the mortgage records and the systems of internal controls for the SONYMA single family loans that are serviced by Community Bank, N.A. He stated that as of the audit date (April 30, 2015), they were servicing approximately \$40 million in loans. He noted that Community Bank is a subsidiary of Community Bank Systems, Inc. which has total assets of \$7.5 billion as of December 31, 2014.

Mr. Chohey reported that SONYMA's loan portfolio is serviced by the Residential Servicing Mortgage Group. He said this unit performs Community Bank's entire mortgage related activity, including acquisitions, originations and servicing of residential and commercial mortgage loans. He said the banks are participating in all the Agencies' bond programs; noting that loan payments can be made at the Bank's branches or through a lock-box (deposits are Federal Deposit Insurance Corporation insured).

Mr. Chohey reported that the results of the audit was that Management was able to satisfactorily achieve its audit objectives. He said there is one item in the report which Accounting Management has responded to.

Considering the first and second motions previously entered, the motions were carried, and the following resolution was unanimously adopted:

A RESOLUTION OF THE AUDIT COMMITTEE OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK MORTGAGE AGENCY REVIEWING AND APPROVING A SERVICER AUDIT OF COMMUNITY BANK, N.A.

The next item on the agenda was a resolution reviewing and approving New York Higher Education Loan Program Audit. Mr. Chohey reported that Internal Audit reviewed the

accounting records and systems of internal control for SONYMA's New York Higher Education Loan Program as of January of 2015. He noted that as of the audit date, there were approximately \$10.5 million in student loans outstanding.

Mr. Chohey provided the relevant background information with regard to this program. He reported that SONYMA (doing business as the State of New York Higher Education Finance Authority) launched the program (NYHELPS) in 2009. NYHEFA issued the NYHELPS Education Loan Revenue Bonds, 2009 Series A, in the amount of \$97.8 million to finance credit-based, fixed-rate education loans originated under the NYHELPS for the benefit of undergraduate and graduate students who attend participating educational institutions in New York State. He said that the demand for the product was low, resulting in \$86.5 million in bonds having been redeemed, thereby, reducing the outstanding bonds to \$11.3 million.

Mr. Chohey noted that, currently, the program has been suspended and the Agency is not originating any loans at this point, however, staff still continues to reconcile accounts and meet the requirements of the debt service.

A discussion ensued as to the program, the reasons for it not being active and what if any steps could be taken to terminate the program.

Mr. Chohey reported that the result of the audit was satisfactory. He said the Directors were asked to accept and approve the report accordingly.

Considering the first and second motions previously entered, the motions were carried, and the following resolution was unanimously adopted:

**A RESOLUTION OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK MORTGAGE AGENCY
AUDIT COMMITTEE REVIEWING AND APPROVING INTERNAL AUDIT'S
NEW YORK HIGHER EDUCATION LOAN PROGRAM AUDIT REPORT**

There being no unfinished business, Ms. Elaine McCann moved to adjourn, Commissioner Rubin seconded the motion and the meeting was adjourned at 8:37 a.m.

Mr. Schuman said that the next Audit Committee meetings are scheduled for Thursday, January 28, 2016 at 8:00 a.m.



Adam H. Schuman, Secretary